	ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 17
	Cards and personal identification
	Secretariat: BSI (United Kingdom)

Document type:	Disposition of Comments Report
Title:	Disposition of comments: FCD ISO/IEC 14443-4:2008/FPDAM1 — Identification cards - Contactless integrated circuit(s) cards — Proximity integrated circuit(s) cards — Part 4: Transmission protocol - Amendment 1: Exchange of additional parameters
Status:	Resolution of FPDAM comments (17n4043).
	BACKWARD POINTER: N 3707, N 3708, N 3779, N 3844, N 3845, N 3879, N 3929, N 3930 and N 4043.
	WORK ITEM: 54823
Date of document:	2010-12-23
Expected action:	INFO
No. of pages:	11
Email of secretary:	chris.starr@ukpayments.org.uk
Committee URL:	http://isotc.iso.org/livelink/livelink/open/jtc1sc17

Disposition of comments on:
FCD ISO/IEC 14443-4:2008/FPDAM1 — Identification cards - Contactless integrated circuit(s) cards — Proximity integrated circuit(s) cards — Part 4: Transmission protocol - Amendment 1: Exchange of additional parameters

Reference documents:
Ballot is in SC17 N 3930 = WG8 N 1705
Ballot Result is in SC17 N 4043 = WG8 N 1729

Project Editor:
Jean-Paul Caruana, France

The following pages provide the details of the comments and detailed information about their resolutions, how WG8 had resolved each received comment from the FCD Ballot (FPDAM) at the WG8 meeting, held in Takamatsu, Japan, on 2010-09-29/10-01.

WG8 decided by WG8 Resolution 48.03 (contained in WG8 N 1737 = SC17 N 4xxx) to issue the new text of 14443-1/AM1, i.e. WG8 N 1742 R1, for FDIS (FDAM) balloting.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB[1]	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment[2]	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
JP1	Cover	Title	ed	For consistency.	Replace "Identification cards — Contactless integrated circuit(s) cards – Proximity cards — Part 4: Transmission protocol" by "Identification cards — Contactless integrated circuit cards – Proximity cards — Part 4: Transmission protocol".	accepted
JP2	Whole documents		ed	Copyright notice "© ISO/IEC 2009 – All rights reserved" should be updated.	Update the copyright notice.	Accepted
JP3	Contents		ed	It is not necessary to describe content list for "Foreword" only.	Reconsider the necessity for describing contents.	Resolve by FR2
JP4	Foreword	Last paragraph	ed	The official name of SC17 is wrong.	Replace "*Card and personal identification*" by "*Cards and personal identification*".	Accepted
JP5	7.1.1.1	3rd dash	ed	For readability	Set the sentence "PARAMETERS" containing … equal to128 bytes." to right after "3)".	Resolve by FR7
JP6	7.1.1.1	Last Paragraph	ed	For consistency.	Replace "0b" and "1b" by "(0)b" and "(1)b", respectively.	Resolve by using (0)b and (1)b
JP7	7.1.1.1	Figure 17	ED	(1) The comment JP4 (1) attached to the 2nd CD ballot, which was accepted (See SC17 N3929), has not been completely resolved yet. (2) For consistency.	For (1), replace "Shall be set to 0, 1 is RFU", "S(PARAMETERS) block if bit is set to 0", "Shall be set to 0", "CID following if bit is set to 1", "if b2 = 0, shall be set to (00)b", "if b2 = 1, (00)b DESELECT or (11)b WTX", by "Shall be set to (0)b, (1)b is RFU", "S(PARAMETERS) block if bit is set to (0)b", "Shall be set to (0)b", "CID following if bit is set to (1)b", "if b2 = (0)b, shall be set to (00)b", "if b2 = (1)b, (00)b DESELECT or (11)b WTX", respectively.	accepted

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

| | Template for comments and secretariat observations | | | | Date: 2010-07-13 | Document: SC17 N 3930 |
| | | | | | | ISO/IEC FCD 14443-4:2008/Amd.1 |

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB[1]	**Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex** (e.g. 3.1)	**Paragraph/ Figure/Table/Note** (e.g. Table 1)	**Type of comment**[2]	**Comment (justification for change) by the MB**	**Proposed change by the MB**	**Secretariat observations** on each comment submitted
					For (2), replace "Replace figure 17 with" by "Replace Figure 17 with".	
JP8	7.5.1	3rd Paragraph	ed	For consistency. In ISO/IEC 7816-4:2005, the term "the context-specific class" is used. Note that ISO/IEC 7816-4 is under revision (CD ballot Stage as of 2010-07-07).	Replace "the contextual class according to ISO/IEC 7816-4." by "the context-specific class according to ISO/IEC 7816-4:2005".	Accepted
JP9	Annex B	New Scenarion to be added after Scenario 9	ed	For consistency.	Set "rule 3" in the sequence 4 to the center of the column.	accepted
JP10	Annex B	Amended Scenarios	ed	For consistency; Block numbers should be described in subscript style.	Replace "I(0)0 and I(0)1" by "I(0)$_0$ and I(0)$_1$", respectively.	Resolve FR19
JP11	Annex B	New Scenario 25	ED	There is a separator line (end of the smallest protocol operation) between the sequence 4 and 5 in the new Scenario 25. However, according to the Scenarios 10, 11, 13, 15, 16, 18, 19, 21, 22 and 23 in ISO/IEC 14443-4:2008, "Time-out" is not the end of the smallest protocol operation. Therefore, the sequence from the sequence 3 to 6 in the new Scenario 25 should be one protocol operations.	Remove the separator line (end of the smallest protocol operation) between the sequence 4 and 5.	accepted

JP12	Annex C	Table C.1	ed	(1) For consistency.
				
				(2) The caption is described under the Table.
				
				(3) The description "S(…)" in the column of "S-block PCB" in redundant.
					For (1), replace "*table C1*" by "*Table C.1*".
					
					For (2), put the caption over the Table.
					
					For (3), remove the description "S(PARAMETERS)".
						Accepted
						
						Accepted
						
						Resolve

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2010-09-09 | Document: **ISO/IEC 14443-4 FPDAM 1.2**

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB¹	**Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex** (e.g. 3.1)	**Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note** (e.g. Table 1)	**Type of com-ment²**	**Comment (justification for change) by the MB**	**Proposed change by the MB**	**Secretariat observations** on each comment submitted
DE 1	Contents	-	ED		Delete section contents and table below (the whole page)	Resolve by FR2
DE 2	P3	Table C.1	ED	The S-block PCB detailed header contains four definitions whereas there are only three columns	Delete text "S(Parameters)"	Resolve by FR13
DE 3	P3	Table C.1	ED	The text PARAMETERS is formatted to be red	Remove colouring of the text	Resolve by FR13

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

| Template for comments and secretariat observations | | | | | Date: 15/03/10 | ISO/IEC FCD14443-4_2008_FPDAM1 | |

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB[1]	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment[2]	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
UK1	Pg 15	3rd numbered bullet	ed	Format error	Remove new paragraph after 3)	Resolve by FR7
UK2	Pg 15	3rd numbered bullet	te	Earlier equipment is unlikely to be able to handled 128 bytes without a hardware upgraded a smaller value would help	Suggest replace 128 bytes by 64 bytes	Resolve by AT1
UK3	Pg 22	Rule 8	ed	Spelling error in final DESELET	Change to DESELECT	accepted

1   **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)

2   **Type of comment:**   **ge** = general   **te** = technical   **ed** = editorial

NOTE   Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB[1]	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com-ment[2]	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
AT1	7.1.1.1	3rd dash, 3)	te	There is no need to violate 14443 protocol parameters with S blocks. Remove the recommendation for FSD and FSC. Instead a dedicated TLV may be used for restricting protocol parameters in the future	Remove the sentence: "FSD and FSC should be greater or equal to 128 bytes"	Resolve by a Note Note: FSD and FSC should be large enough to contain the expected S(PARAMETERS) blocks.
AT2	7.1.1.1	Last paragraph	te	A PICC or PCD not supporting S(PARAMETERS) shall not be compliant when setting (b2,b1) <> (10)b. A PICC or PCD supporting S(PARAMTERS) shall not be compliant when setting b1 <> (0)b	Replace last sentence of paragraph by: "A PICC or PCD not supporting S(PARAMETERS) and setting (b2,b1) <>(10)b of a S-block is not compliant with the standard. A PICC or PCD supporting S(PARAMETERS) and setting b1 <> 0b of an S(PARAMTERS) block is not compliant with the standard."	Resolve by deleting the last sentence
AT3	7.5.1	First paragraph	te	To check whether a PICC supports S(PARAMETERS) or not, the PCD may send an S(PARAMETERS) block containing no INF field.	Add a second sentence after the first sentence: "This S(PARAMTERS) blocks may contain no information field."	Accepted with sentence After the activation sequence, the PCD may send at any time a first S(PARAMETERS) block with or without INF field to check if S(PARAMETERS) blocks are supported by the PICC.
AT4	7.5.4.2	Rule 8	ED	There is some repetition in rule 8	Replace rule 8 by: "Rule 8. If the S(DESELECT)/S(PARAMETERS) request is not answered by an error-free S(DESELECT)/S(PARAMETERS) response the S(DESELECT)/S(PARAMETERS) request may be retransmitted. In case of not receiving S(DESELET) on an S(DESELECT) request the PICC may be ignored.	Resolve by FR 11
AT5	Table C.1	S-block PCB	ed	There is S(PARAMETERS) and PARAMETERS in the table	Remove "S(PARAMETERS)"	accepted

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB[1]	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com-ment[2]	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition
FR1	1st page	title	ed	The amendment title in French is missing	Add: Amendement 1 : Echange de paramètres additionnels	accepted
FR2	Content		ed	No content page is needed in amendments	Delete this page	accepted
FR3	7		ed	The instruction is not clear about which clause/subclause it refers. Only the location must be in italics, not the instruction	Replace *Page 14 of ISO/IEC 14443-4:2008, add before 3rd paragraph the following paragraph:* with *Page 14 of ISO/IEC 14443-4:2008, Clause 7* Add the following paragraph before 3rd paragraph:	accepted
FR4	7		ed	ISO style in "A mechanism is provided in order to introduce additional protocol functions that may be defined from time to time in this standard or in other standards that use this standard as their foundation"	Use normal style (with font 10)	accepted
FR5	7.1.1.1		ed	Use dash to replace the 3rd dash. Reduce the space between this paragraph and the enumeration 1) 2) 3)	Add a ISO style dash before "S-block used…"	accepted
FR6	7.1.1.1		ed	typo	Add a space after the 1st sentence, before "The support of"	accepted
FR7	7.1.1.1	3)	ed	typo	Use ISO style for 1) 2) 3) and starts "PARAMETERS" just after 3)	accepted

1   **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)

2   **Type of comment: ge** = general   **te** = technical   **ed** = editorial – For technical comments, please indicate whether your comment is a MAJOR or MINOR technical comment.

NOTE   Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB[1]	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment[2]	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition
FR8	7.1.1.1	Figure 17	ED	b2 definition is not complete and not consistent with b6b5 definition	Replace S(PARAMETERS) block if bit set to 0 with PARAMETERS if bit is set to 0 DESELECT or WTX if bit is set to 1	Accepted To be change in the figure
FR9	7.5.4.2	Rule 4	ed	ISO style	Use "rule" style like in 14443-4:2008	Accepted
FR10	7.5.4.2	Rule 8	ed	ISO style	Use "rule" style like in 14443-4:2008	accepted
FR11	7.5.4.2	Rule 8	ED	The last sentence is useless (see accepted comment DE2 in last ballot)	Delete the last sentence "If the S(PARAMETERS) request is not answered by an error-free S(PARAMETERS) response…"	Resolve by AT4 : "Rule 8. If the S(DESELECT)/S(PARAMETERS) request is not answered by an error-free S(DESELECT)/S(PARAMETERS) response the S(DESELECT)/S(PARAMETERS) request may be retransmitted. In case of not receiving an S(DESELECT) response after an S(DESELECT) request the PICC may be ignored.
FR12	Table C1		ed	Instructions must follow the document sequence	Move this instruction _after_ instructions relative to annex B	accepted
FR13	Table C1		ed	typos	Delete "S(PARAMETERS)" Change the color of "PARAMETERS" from red to black	accepted

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB[1]	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com-ment[2]	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition
FR14	Annex B		ed	Only the location must be in italics, not the instruction There in only one scenario to add	Replace *In the Annex B of ISO/IEC 14443-4:2008, add the following scenarios page 29 after scenario 9* with *Page 29 of ISO/IEC 14443-4:2008, Annex B* Add the following scenario after scenario 9:	accepted
FR15	Annex B		ed	ISO style	Use bold for "B2.6 Exchange of additional parameters"	accepted
FR16	Annex B		ed	The new scenario in B.2.6 has no number	Use "Scenario 10" and renumber all subsequent scenarios or any other numbering solution like "Scenario Amd.1.1" (and Scenario Amd.1.2" for the second one)	Accepted with "Scenario Amd.1.1" (and Scenario Amd.1.2" for the second one)
FR17	Annex B		ed	Only the location must be in italics, not the instruction There in only one scenario to add	Replace *In the Annex B of ISO/IEC 14443-4:2008, add the following scenarios page 34 after scenario 24* with *Page 34 of ISO/IEC 14443-4:2008, Annex B* Add the following scenario after scenario 24:	accepted
FR18	Annex B	Scenario 25, step 4	ed	When the PICC does not answer the arrow must be different (see existing scenarios)	Replace <=== with <= =	accepted

1   **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)

2   **Type of comment:**   **ge** = general   **te** = technical   **ed** = editorial – For technical comments, please indicate whether your comment is a MAJOR or MINOR technical comment.

NOTE   Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB[1]	**Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex** (e.g. 3.1)	**Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note** (e.g. Table 1)	**Type of com- ment[2]**	**Comment (justification for change) by the MB**	**Proposed change by the MB**	**Proposed Editors Disposition**
FR19	Annex B	All new scenarios	ed	The block number in I-blocks must use subscript	Replace I(0)0 with $I(0)_0$ and so on 8 times	accepted

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB[1]	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com-ment[2]	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
**	General		ed	Introductory wording for instructions for items to be amended is incorrect.	Re-draft introductory instructions using clause and subclause references, and delete the references to the document (that is delete "*of ISO/IEC 14443-4:2008*"), for example as follows: "*Page 14, Clause 7* Following the first list add the following paragraph:*"* *"Page 15, 7.1.1.1* Replace the third dash with: ... Replace the last paragraph with:" *"Page 16, Figure 17* Replace Figure 17 with:" Etc. In re-drafting the introductory instructions, note that the instructions for the amendments to Annex B should appear before the instructions for amendments to Annex C. The table title for Table C.1 should appear above the table, not below.	accepted

1   **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)

2   **Type of comment:**   **ge** = general   **te** = technical   **ed** = editorial

NOTE   Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10